

Dynamics of malaria vector indices in two vegetation zones within North Eastern Adamawa State, Nigeria

Wahedi, J.A.^{1,2*}, Ande, A.T.², Oduola, A.O.², Obembe, A.³, Tola, M.⁴, Oyeniya, T.A.⁴ and Awolola, T.S.⁴

¹Department of Zoology, Adamawa State University, Mubi, Nigeria

²Department of Zoology, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria

³Department of Biosciences and Biotechnology, Kwara State University, Malete, Nigeria

⁴Molecular Entomology and Vector Control Research Laboratory, Nigerian Institute of Medical Research, Yaba, Lagos, Nigeria

*Corresponding author e-mail: wahedijasini@gmail.com

Received 10 March 2020; received in revised form 12 June 2020; accepted 15 June 2020

Abstract. Studies profiling community and zonal malaria entomological risk indices are required to identify high risk areas where targeted control resources are most needed or likely to have the greatest impact on reducing risk of malaria infection. This study presents a first report on malaria vector risk indices in two vegetation zones within Adamawa state, Nigeria. Endophilic mosquitoes were collected for one year in selected communities in the Guinea and Sudan savanna zones within the State. *Plasmodium falciparum* Sporozoite and human blood meal ELISA assays were carried out on the female *Anopheles* mosquitoes collected. Sibling species composition of the *An. gambiae* complex were determined using PCR assays. Mean numbers of mosquitoes in the Guinea savanna communities were significantly ($t = 7.73$, $DF = 11$, $p < 0.001$) higher than the Sudan. Man-biting rates ($F = 2.76$, $p = 0.13$) of *Anopheles* mosquitoes were higher in the Guinea but not significantly different from Sudan savanna. Sporozoite rates of mosquitoes within the Guinea savanna were 2.7 times higher than the Sudan. The predominant *Anopheles coluzzii* species encountered in the state had higher overall human blood indices (0.63) and sporozoite rates (6.9%) compared to *An. gambiae* (0.39, 1.9%) and *An. arabiensis* (0.58, 2.3%) respectively. Overall annual human blood indices (0.59) of mosquitoes in Adamawa were lower compared to reports from other States. Prevalence and higher transmission risks indices of endophilic *An. coluzzii* mosquitoes reveal the need for LLIN and management of relatively permanent *An. coluzzii* breeding sites in the State. Widespread cattle rearing lifestyle and lower human blood indices of mosquitoes in the study area suggest the need to investigate cattle blood indices of the mosquitoes in the state. Higher entomological risk indices in the Guinea Savanna zone provide baseline information for prioritization of malaria vector control supplies within the State.

INTRODUCTION

Evidences of reductions in malaria disease burdens have been reported especially within the last decade. Between 2010 and 2018, malaria case incidence levels reduced by 70 and 22% in the WHO South-East Asia and the African Regions respectively (WHO, 2019). The global decline in malaria disease burdens have been linked partly with the deployments of malaria vector control tools such as long-lasting insecticidal nets (LLINs) and indoor residual spray (IRS). In Nigeria,

where the highest (25%) global malaria burden occurs (WHO, 2019), LLIN distribution campaigns and pockets of IRS implementations have been ongoing since 2009. Consequently, the Nigerian population at risk sleeping under an insecticide-treated net (ITN) or protected by IRS have increased by at least 20% with a corresponding 20–40% decrease in malaria mortality rate between 2010 and 2015 (WHO, 2016). While the global search for new vector control tools continues, current gains can be sustained through informed localized interventions guided by

the knowledge of malaria entomological indices (WHO, 2013). Since intervention effects vary in space as driven by local endemicity levels, studies profiling community and regional malaria entomological risk indices are required to identify high risk areas where targeted strategies and resources are most needed or likely to have the greatest impact on reducing risk of malaria infection (Giardini *et al.*, 2014). These kinds of studies are crucial to the sustenance and furtherance of the recorded malaria reduction rates which is already slowing down and has remained at similar levels between 2014 and 2018 (WHO, 2019). Intra-regional and country variations in malaria entomological indices have been reported across sub-Saharan Africa (Daygena *et al.*, 2017; Ototo *et al.*, 2015; Walker *et al.*, 2013; Oduola *et al.*, 2012; Kigadye *et al.*, 2011; Tchuinkam *et al.*, 2010). However, in Nigeria, much of the malaria vector risk indices data have been generated from the South Western part of the Country (Awolola *et al.*, 2002; Oyewole *et al.*, 2007; Oyewole *et al.*, 2010; Oduola *et al.*, 2013) leaving out other regions such as the North East where only few longitudinal studies involving proper characterization of malaria vector samples, using standard methods, have been reported (Yoriyo *et al.*, 2014; Samdi, 2012). Adamawa is a unique North Eastern State representing one of the largest States in Nigeria. Some of its peculiarities include the presence of both Guinea and Sudan Savanna areas and the prevalence of flood plains with many rivers passing through the Fadama lands all over the State especially during the rainy season (Adewumi, 2013). Despite the foregoing and the data confirming Adamawa as the State with the highest malaria prevalence rate (55.5%) in the North Eastern region of Nigeria (NMEP, 2016), there has been no report, to our knowledge, on malaria vector risk indices in the different vegetation zones within the State. Such reports are necessary for successful planning, implementation and assessments of effective malaria vector control programmes within the State in order to contribute to the reduction of the malaria burden in the country. This study

presents a first report on malaria vector indices across selected communities within the two vegetation zones in Adamawa state, Northeastern Nigeria.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Study area and design

Adamawa State is one of the largest states in Nigeria, with about 38,700km² land area and an estimated human population of 4,502,132 (NPC, 2020). It is located in North Eastern Nigeria with major vegetation formations comprising Guinea and Sudan Savannas (NPC, 2020). Annual rainfalls in the Sudan (700mm-900mm, 3-4 months), Southern (1100mm-1600mm, 6-7 months) and Northern (900-1100mm, 4-5 months) Guinea Savanna zones of the state last for about three to seven months respectively (Akosim *et al.*, 1999). The wettest months are August and September while the dry season starts in November and ends in April (Adebayo, 1999). Relative humidity is usually very low (20–30%) between January and March with increase as from April to a maximum of 80% in August and September (Adebayo, 1999). Adamawa is one of the Nigerian States with very high concentration of livestock, the most significant being the 3.5 million Adamawa gudali cattle managed in relatively small herd sizes by settled pastoralists who rarely move very far but send their cattle to favourable locales at the peak of the dry season (Tukur and Ardo, 1999). Four communities were selected on the basis of proximity to similar river tributaries which may form suitable breeding habitats for *Anopheles* mosquitoes (Table 1). Two of the communities (Bazza and Vimtim) are located in the Sudan Savanna while the other two (Imburu and Bachure) belong to the Northern Guinea Savanna zone, hereafter referred to as Guinea Savanna zone. The communities had houses without major barriers (ceilings and window nets) to mosquito entry and were similar in that some of the residents were settled pastoralists engaging in extensive cattle management systems. The community residents all lacked LLINs probably because of the long interval between the last LLIN

Table 1. Description of study communities in the two vegetation zones in Adamawa State

Vegetation Zone	Community	River tributaries present	Coordinates
Sudan Savanna	Bazza	Yedsaram	10°33.50N, 13°23.00E
Sudan Savanna	Vintim	Yedsaram	10°23.50N, 13°21.00E
Guinea Savanna	Bachure	Benue	09°16.50N, 12°24.50E
Guinea Savanna	Imburu	Benue	09°30.00N, 11.5°20.00E

distribution campaign in the State in 2010 and the period of the study in 2016.

Endophilic mosquito collection and identification

Indoor resting mosquitoes were collected monthly between January and December, 2016 from ten rooms in each of the four communities using pyrethrum spray collection method. The room chosen in each house were used throughout the study. Each room was selected only if the occupants affirmed readiness to allow the use of the rooms throughout the period of the study. The number of persons that slept in each room over the night before mosquito collection was recorded for man-biting rates estimations (Shililu *et al.*, 1998; WHO 2003). Each female mosquito sample collected was preserved on silica gel in 1.5ml Eppendorf tube for further analysis at The Nigerian Institute of Medical Research, Lagos. All samples were identified morphologically (Gillies and Coetzee, 1987) before species-specific PCR (Scott *et al.*, 1993) and PCR-RFLP (Favia *et al.*, 1997) assays were conducted on 98% (161/164) and 95% (437/458) of the female *An. gambiae* s.l. collected in Sudan and Guinea Savanna zones respectively.

Determination of *P. falciparum* infection and presence of human blood in mosquitoes

Plasmodium falciparum sporozoite ELISA (Wirtz *et al.*, 1987) were conducted on heads-thoraces of all collected female *An. gambiae* (s.l.) samples using monoclonal antibodies and positive controls from Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (Atlanta, USA). Human blood meal ELISA (Beier *et al.*, 1988) carried out on all

blood-fed and half-gravid samples were done using human serum and monoclonal antibodies obtained respectively from Rockland immunochemicals (Gilbertsville, USA) and Kikergaard and Perry Laboratories (Gaithersburg, USA).

Data analyses

Recorded number of persons in the rooms was taken as a reflection of human availability for mosquito bites since the community residents were not sleeping under bed-nets. Proportion of blood-fed and half-gravid samples found with human blood was taken as Human blood index (HBI). Man-biting rates (MBR) were estimated as the number of blood-fed and half-gravid samples collected divided by the number of persons who slept in the rooms over the night before mosquito collection multiplied by HBI (Shililu *et al.*, 1998; WHO 2003). Data obtained were transformed [$\sqrt{n + 0.5}$] (Ogbeigbu, 2005) to normal distribution. Mean numbers, human blood indices and man-biting rates of female *Anopheles gambiae* (s.l.) mosquitoes collected monthly in the two communities per zone were pooled and compared between the two zones. The Proportional data (HBI and MBR) were compared by logistic regression while mean numbers of mosquitoes were compared using Student's t-test (SPSS 16 software) at $p < 0.05$.

RESULTS

Numbers of female *Anopheles* mosquitoes collected monthly from the Guinea and Sudan savanna communities are presented in Table 2. Highest numbers of female

Table 2. Numbers of female *Anopheles* mosquitoes in the communities in Adamawa State

Month	Sudan Savanna Zone						Guinea Savanna Zone					
	Actual values			Transformed values			Actual values			Transformed values		
	Bazza	Vimtim	Total	Bazza	Vimtim	Total	Imburu	Bachure	Total	Imburu	Bachure	Total
Jan	3	6	9	1.87	2.55	4.42	27	3	30	5.24	1.87	7.11
Feb	3	6	9	1.87	2.55	4.42	15	5	20	3.94	2.35	6.29
Mar	10	4	14	3.24	2.12	5.36	31	9	40	5.61	3.08	8.69
April	3	5	8	1.87	2.35	4.22	43	12	55	6.59	3.54	10.13
May	3	3	6	1.87	1.87	3.74	18	0	18	4.30	0.71	5.01
June	10	3	13	3.24	1.87	5.11	35	17	52	5.96	4.18	10.14
July	18	5	23	4.30	2.35	6.65	37	24	61	7.84	4.95	11.07
Aug	29	11	40	5.43	3.39	8.82	32	23	55	7.45	4.85	10.55
Sept	6	3	9	2.55	1.87	4.42	15	28	43	3.94	5.34	9.28
Oct	4	9	13	2.12	3.08	5.20	25	16	41	5.05	4.06	9.11
Nov	5	5	10	2.35	2.35	4.70	22	5	27	4.74	2.35	7.09
Dec	6	4	10	2.55	2.12	4.67	14	2	16	3.81	1.58	5.39
Mean±			13.67±	2.77±	2.37±	5.14±			38.17±	5.08±	3.24±	8.32±
S.D			9.36	1.12	0.48	1.37			15.76	0.94	1.48	2.08^b

Transformation formula: $N = \sqrt{n+0.5}$, N-transformed value, n-actual value. Mean numbers with different letter superscript are significantly different at $p < 0.05$.

Anopheles mosquitoes were collected in both zones between the month of June and August. A total of 458 (Mean 38.17±15.76) female *Anopheles* mosquitoes was collected in the Guinea savanna compared to 164 (Mean 13.67±9.36) mosquitoes found in the Sudan savanna zone (Table 2). Mean numbers of female *Anopheles* mosquitoes collected in the two Sudan savanna communities were not significantly ($t = 1.329$, $DF = 11$, $p = 0.211$) different from each other. However, significant differences ($t = 4.680$, $DF = 11$, $p = 0.001$) were found between the numbers of female *Anopheles* collected in the two communities within the Guinea savanna zone of the state (Table 2).

Transformed mean of the total numbers of female *Anopheles* in the Guinea savanna zone (6.09±1.33) was significantly ($t = 7.731$, $DF = 11$, $p < 0.001$) higher than that of mosquitoes in the Sudan savanna (3.63±1.04) zone (Table 2). Between the two communities in each zone, the mean man-biting rates of *Anopheles* mosquitoes were not significantly different (Guinea $F = 0.045$, $p = 0.837$; Sudan $F = 1.685$, $p = 0.223$).

Mean man-biting rate of mosquitoes in the Guinea savanna (1.27±0.57) was higher compared to 0.51±0.38 in the Sudan savanna zone (Table 3).

Transformed mean man-biting rates of *Anopheles* mosquitoes were higher in the Guinea savanna (1.31±0.22) but not significantly ($F = 2.76$, $p = 0.13$) different from the Sudan savanna (0.99±0.17) zone (Table 3).

Human blood indices and man-biting rates of each *Anopheles* mosquito species encountered in all the communities are presented in Tables 4 and 5 respectively. Number of blood-fed *An. coluzzii* mosquitoes in the Guinea savanna (306) was 2.2 times higher than the number of the same species in the Sudan savanna (142) zone (Table 4). However, the number of *An. gambiae* mosquitoes in the Guinea savanna (89) zone was 5.2 times higher compared to the number of *An. gambiae* in Sudan savanna (17) zone (Table 3). Similarly, the number of *An. arabiensis* in the Guinea savanna was far higher (42 times) higher than the number of *An. arabiensis* in the Sudan savanna zone (Table 4).

Anopheles coluzzii had higher human blood indices and man-biting rates (0.63, 0.36) compared to *An. gambiae* (0.39, 0.05) and *An. arabiensis* (0.58, 0.03) species (Tables 4 and 5). In total, only about half (HBI 0.59) of all *Anopheles* mosquitoes

Table 3. Man-biting rates of *Anopheles* mosquitoes in the two zones in Adamawa State

Month	Sudan Savanna Zone				Guinea Savanna Zone			
	Actual values		Total	Transformed total value	Actual values		Total	Transformed total value
	Bazza	Vimtim			Imburu	Bachure		
January	0.13	0.33	0.46	0.98	0.78	0.10	0.88	1.17
February	0.07	0.23	0.30	0.89	0.47	0.14	0.61	1.05
March	0.33	0.19	0.52	1.01	1.41	0.21	1.62	1.46
April	0.00	0.24	0.24	0.86	1.34	0.27	1.61	1.45
May	0.25	0.06	0.31	0.90	0.39	0.00	0.39	0.94
June	0.31	0.12	0.43	0.96	1.45	0.67	2.12	1.62
July	0.72	0.19	0.91	1.19	1.32	0.78	2.10	1.61
August	1.00	0.54	1.54	1.43	0.89	0.65	1.54	1.43
September	0.29	0.00	0.29	0.89	0.37	0.94	1.31	1.35
October	0.21	0.47	0.68	1.09	0.87	0.56	1.43	1.39
November	0.13	0.12	0.25	0.87	0.83	0.21	1.04	1.24
December	0.11	0.13	0.24	0.86	0.47	0.13	0.60	1.05
Mean±S.D			0.51±0.38	0.99±0.17 ^a			1.27±0.57	1.31±0.22 ^a

Transformation formula: $N = \sqrt{n+0.5}$, N-transformed value, n-actual value. Mean numbers with the same letter superscript are not significantly different at $p < 0.05$.

Table 4. Human blood indices of different *Anopheles* mosquito species in the communities in Adamawa state

Zone	<i>An. gambiae</i>				<i>An. coluzzii</i>				<i>An. arabiensis</i>				Total No of <i>An</i> with blood	HBI	
	No of <i>An</i> with human blood	No of <i>An</i> with blood	HBI	No of <i>An</i> with human blood	No of <i>An</i> with blood	HBI	No of <i>An</i> with human blood	No of <i>An</i> with blood	HBI	No of <i>An</i> with human blood	No of <i>An</i> with blood	HBI			
Sudan Savanna															
Bazza	0	6	0.00	48	90	0.53	0	1	0.00	48	97	0.4			
Vimtim	2	11	0.18	39	52	0.75	0	0	0.00	41	63	0.65			
Total	2	17	0.11	87	142	0.61	0	1	0.00	89	160	0.55			
Guinea Savanna															
Imburu	24	62	0.39	132	197	0.67	22	35	0.63	178	294	0.61			
Bachure	16	27	0.59	65	109	0.59	3	7	0.43	84	143	0.59			
Total	40	89	0.45	197	306	0.64	25	42	0.59	262	437	0.59			
Grand Total	42	106	0.39	284	448	0.63	25	43	0.58	351	597	0.59			

HBI (Human blood index) = number of *Anopheles* with human blood/ number of *Anopheles* with blood.

Table 5. Man-biting rates of the different *Anopheles* mosquito species in the study communities

Zone	No of sleepers	<i>An. gambiae</i>			<i>An. coluzzii</i>			<i>An. arabiensis</i>			Total No of <i>An</i> with blood	HBI	MBR (bites/ person/ night)
		No. with blood	HBI	MBR (bites/ person/ night)	No. with blood	HBI	MBR (bites/ person/ night)	No. with blood	HBI	MBR (bites/ person/ night)			
Sudan Savanna													
Bazza	176	6	0.00	0.00	90	0.53	0.27	1	0.00	0.00	97	0.49	0.27
Vimtim	191	11	0.18	0.01	52	0.75	0.20	0	0.00	0.00	63	0.65	0.21
Total	367	17	0.11	0.01	142	0.61	0.24	1	0.00	0.00	160	0.55	0.24
Guinea Savanna													
Imburu	207	62	0.39	0.12	197	0.67	0.64	35	0.63	0.11	294	0.61	0.87
Bachure	212	27	0.59	0.08	109	0.59	0.30	7	0.43	0.01	143	0.59	0.39
Total	419	89	0.45	0.09	306	0.64	0.47	42	0.59	0.06	437	0.59	0.62
Grand Total	786	106	0.39	0.05	448	0.63	0.36	43	0.58	0.03	597	0.59	0.45

HBI-human blood index, MBR-man-biting rate.

collected from both zones were found with human blood (Table 4).

In both Sudan and Guinea Savanna communities respectively, sporozoite infection rates were higher among the *An. coluzzii* (2.8%, 8.8%) mosquitoes compared to *An. gambiae* (0%, 2.2%) and *An. arabiensis* (0%, 2.4%) species (Table 6). Sporozoite infection rates of all the mosquitoes collected in the Guinea Savanna (6.9%) communities were 2.9 times higher than those of the Sudan savanna (2.4%) communities (Table 6).

Predominance of *An. coluzzii* species (88.2%, 70%) were observed over *An. gambiae* (10.6%, 20.4%) and *An. arabiensis* (0.6%, 9.6%) in the Sudan and Guinea Savanna zones respectively (Table 6). Higher occurrences of *An. coluzzii* ($\geq 67\%$) compared to *An. gambiae* ($\leq 20.9\%$) and *An. arabiensis* ($\leq 15.7\%$) were evident in each of the four communities (Table 6).

DISCUSSION

This study provides information on species composition and entomological risk indices of *Anopheles* mosquitoes in two vegetation zones within Northeastern Adamawa State, Nigeria. Increased relative humidity between June and August (80% in August) in Adamawa State (Adebayo, 1999) probably resulted in the collection of higher numbers of mosquitoes within this period across the four communities in the two zones of the State. Significantly higher numbers of mosquitoes found in the communities within the Guinea savanna zone is attributable to longer rainy season period and higher annual rainfall compared to the Sudan savanna zone of the State. Annual mean number of female *Anopheles* mosquitoes recorded here in the Guinea Savanna areas of Adamawa State compares with earlier reports (Obembe *et al.*, 2018; Obembe *et al.*, 2019) from Kwara, another Guinea Savanna Nigerian State. Similarities in the numbers of female *Anopheles* mosquitoes collected in the two communities within Sudan Savanna zone of Adamawa State reflects similar climatic conditions in the two communities within the zone. In contrast, significantly higher

number of *Anopheles* mosquitoes in Imburu community compared to the Bachure community within the same Guinea Savanna zone could be due to the higher prevalence of irrigated rice mowed areas providing year round breeding sites for mosquitoes in and around Imburu community.

Predominance of *An. coluzzii* over *An. gambiae* in both Guinea and Sudan Savanna communities within Adamawa State is in contrast with the observation of lower *An. coluzzii* incidence in some Savanna regions of Nigeria (Awolola *et al.*, 2005; Obembe *et al.*, 2018). Both *Anopheles coluzzii* and *An. gambiae* mosquito species are known to be naturally anthropophilic and endophilic and therefore considered as very competent vectors in Africa (Gillies and Coetzee 1987; Githeko *et al.*, 1994; Killeen, 2014). However, *An. gambiae* can better utilize small temporary breeding sites (Gimonneau *et al.*, 2014) while *An. coluzzii* prefers flooded relatively permanent breeding sites (Sogoba *et al.*, 2008; Gimonneau *et al.*, 2012). Adamawa State is characterized by flood plains with many rivers passing through the Fadama lands all over the State especially during the rainy season (Adewumi, 2013). These flood plains could have provided the relatively permanent breeding sites preferred by *An. coluzzii* larvae leading to its prevalence over *An. gambiae* and *An. arabiensis* in the four communities considered in this study. Lamidi *et al.* (2017) have also reported the prevalence of *An. coluzzii* in another neighboring Northeastern State of Taraba.

Higher occurrence of *Anopheles coluzzii* among the mosquitoes collected indoors may indicate increased human-vector contact leading to the observations of higher *Anopheles coluzzii* human blood indices, man-biting and sporozoite rates compared to *An. gambiae* and *An. arabiensis*.

Single populations of *An. arabiensis* species typically breed in ephemeral, sunlit water pools (Kenea *et al.*, 2011) and can exhibit a wide range of behaviours, biting and resting indoors as well as outdoors and feeding on both humans and animals (Githeko *et al.*, 1994; Tirados *et al.*, 2006; Kitau *et al.*, 2012; Mayagaya *et al.*, 2015). Therefore, low

Table 6. Species composition and *P. falciparum* Sporozoite infection rates of mosquitoes in the study communities

Zone	Study site	Numbers (%) of different <i>Anopheles</i> species identified					†Number (%) of <i>Anopheles</i> positive for <i>P. falciparum</i> sporozoite infection				
		<i>An. gambiae</i>	<i>An. coluzzii</i>	<i>An. arabiensis</i>	Hybrid	Number assayed	<i>An. gambiae</i>	<i>An. coluzzii</i>	<i>An. arabiensis</i>	Total no of female <i>Anopheles</i>	Total positive
Sudan Savanna	Bazza	6(6)	90(92)	1(1)	1(1)	98(100)	0(0)	2(2.2)	0(0)	100	2(2.0)
	Vimtim	11(17)	52(83)	0(0)	0(0)	63(100)	0(0)	2(3.8)	0(0)	64	2(3.1)
	Total	17(10.6)	142(88.2)	1(0.6)	1(0.6)	161(100)	0(0)	4(2.8)	0(0)	164	4(2.4)
Guinea Savanna	Imburu	62(21)	197(67)	35(12)	0(0)	294(100)	2(3.2)	14(7.1)	1(2.9)	314	17(5.4)
	Bachure	27(19)	109(76)	7(5)	0(0)	143(100)	0(0)	13(11.9)	0(0)	144	13(9.0)
	Total	89(20.4)	306(70)	42(9.6)	0(0)	437(100)	2(2.2)	27(8.8)	1(2.4)	458	30(6.5)
Grand Total		106(17.7)	448(74.9)	43(7.2)	1(0.2)	598(100)	2(1.9)	31(6.9)	1(2.3)	622	34(5.5)

† Number of each *Anopheles* species was used as the denominator in calculating the sporozoite rate of such species.

occurrence of indoor resting *An. arabiensis* mosquitoes in this study could also be due to their zoophilic and exophilic tendencies (Mahande *et al.*, 2007; Mayagaya *et al.*, 2015). This is in consonance with the results of 0.6% *An. arabiensis* incidence in two communities in Guinea Savanna area of Kwara State (Obembe *et al.*, 2018). Generally, all the mosquito species had higher numbers in the Guinea savanna compared to the Sudan Savanna zone. However, the difference between the numbers of *An. coluzzii* mosquitoes found in both zones was low compared to the difference between the numbers of mosquitoes of other species (between *An. gambiae* and *An. gambiae*; between *An. arabiensis* and *An. arabiensis*) found in both zones. Lower differences in the number of *An. coluzzii* found in both zones could be as a result of widespread presence of suitable relatively permanent breeding sites (flood plains) available for *An. coluzzii* development in both zones of the State. However, high differences between the numbers of *An. gambiae* in both zones and between the numbers of *An. arabiensis* in both zones is attributable to the higher and longer rainfall resulting in the availability of more small and temporary breeding sites suitable for these two species in the Guinea compared to the Sudan Savanna zone. These high differences in the numbers of *An. gambiae* and *An. arabiensis* between the two zones probably led to the highly different human blood indices of *An. gambiae* and *An. arabiensis* between the two zones. Higher man-biting and *P. falciparum* sporozoite infection rates of *Anopheles* mosquitoes in the communities within the Guinea savanna compared to the Sudan is attributable to the significantly higher *Anopheles* densities found indoors in the former.

Naturally anthropophilic and endophilic *An. coluzzii* species, which had favourable breeding sites within our study area and was the most abundant within the human dwellings, exhibited the highest human blood index (0.63). However this *An. coluzzii* HBI and the overall annual human blood indices of all the *Anopheles* mosquitoes collected in the State (0.59) were lower compared to

those reported in other North Eastern States of Gombe (0.71-1.00 (Yoriyo *et al.*, 2014) and Borno (0.98 (Samdi, 2012)). This results remain puzzling because the lower human blood indices recorded could not have resulted from the use of bed-nets since this was not found in the communities. Also, widespread availability of cattle may not have caused this since *An. coluzzii* are not known to be zoophilic than anthropophilic when both humans and cattle are present. However, indoor insecticide application can induce zoophagic tendencies (Lefevre *et al.*, 2009; Ndenga *et al.*, 2016) or earlier outdoor biting times (Bayoh *et al.*, 2010; Reddy *et al.*, 2011; Gatton *et al.*, 2013) among previously anthropophilic, endophilic and nocturnal *An. gambiae*, *An. coluzzii* and *An. funestus* species. A common practice found among the community residents in this study area was the use of dried and smoldered leaves and/or freshly hung whole plants as indoor mosquito repellents. As such, a probable reason for the relatively low mosquito human blood indices could be the use of these traditional mosquito repellents driving a sizeable portion of the anthropophilic mosquitoes to subsist on the cattle around the communities. Whether or not this freshly hung or smoldered plants can serve as effective mosquito repellents remains to be investigated. Also, studies on cattle blood indices of the mosquitoes in these areas are required to confirm the subsistence of the mosquitoes on cattle. In addition, studies on the use of improved zoophylaxis (treating the cattle with recommended doses of appropriate insecticides) could be conducted in these areas to determine the potential of this method in further reducing malaria entomological risk indices in these areas.

This study is limited by the non-collection of outdoor resting mosquitoes in addition to non-determination of cattle blood indices of the indoor resting mosquitoes collected. However, the unavailability and non-utilization of insecticide-treated bed-nets by the community residents, prevalence of cattle as the major animal host within the environment of mosquito collection and non-detection of human blood in about half of the mosquitoes collected, suggest that

the engorged *Anopheles* mosquitoes devoid of human blood could be carrying cattle blood meal.

CONCLUSION

This study revealed variations in entomological risk indices of *Anopheles* mosquitoes in two vegetation zones within a North-Eastern State of Nigeria. Higher entomological risk indices were observed in the Guinea compared to the Sudan Savanna areas of the State. This provides baseline information for prioritization of supplies in the event of scarce mosquito control resources. Studies of this nature are desirable to guide malaria control programmes according to the peculiarities existing in various areas within a State. Prevalence and higher transmission risks indices of endophilic *An. coluzzii* mosquito species reveal the need for integrated malaria vector control management involving the reinforcements of LLIN availability and utilization as well as larval source management of the relatively permanent *An. coluzzii* mosquito breeding sites in the State. Low occurrence of *An. arabiensis* indoors within these cattle dominated areas calls for investigations on outdoor vector species composition and transmission in these areas. Widespread cattle rearing lifestyle as well as lower human blood indices of *Anopheles* mosquitoes in these areas as compared to other savanna areas in Nigeria suggest the need to initiate studies on the cattle blood indices of the mosquitoes in this study area. Such studies may assist in determining the suitability of the use of zooprophylactic malaria risk reduction measures such as insecticide-treated cattle in the study area.

Acknowledgements. The authors wish to thank the community residents for their cooperation throughout the period of the study. We appreciate Drs. Alice and Robert Wirtz of the Centres for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, USA, for supplying the sporozoite ELISA reagents.

Competing interests

None declared.

Authors' contributions

WJA and ATA conceived the study. AOO, ATA and STA designed the study. WJA and AOO supervised the field study and data collection. TAO, MT, WJA and AO conducted the laboratory studies. AO and WJA collated and analyzed the data. AO drafted the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final version of the manuscript.

REFERENCES

- Adebayo, A.A. (1999). Climate I: Sunshine, temperature, evaporation and relative humidity. In: Adamawa State in Maps, Adebayo, A & Tukur, A. (editors). Yola: Paraclete Publisher; pp. 20-22.
- Adeyemi, A.S. (2013). Analysis of land use/land cover pattern along the River Benue channel in Adamawa State, Nigeria. *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies* **2(5)**: 95-107.
- Akosim, C., Tella, I.O. & Jatau, D.F. (1999). Vegetation and forest resources. In: Adamawa State in Maps, Adebayo, A. & Tukur, A. (editors). Yola: Paraclete Publisher; pp. 32-35.
- Awolola, T.S., Okwa, O., Hunt, R.H., Ogunrinde, A.F. & Coetzee, M. (2002). Dynamics of the malaria-vector populations in coastal Lagos, south-western Nigeria. *Annals of Tropical Medicine and Parasitology* **96(1)**: 75-82.
- Awolola, T.S., Oyewole, I.O., Amajoh, C.N., Idowu, E.T., Ajayi, M.B., Oduola, A. & Coetzee, M. (2005). Distribution of the molecular forms of *Anopheles gambiae* and pyrethroid knock down resistance gene in Nigeria. *Acta Tropica* **95(3)**: 204-209.
- Bayoh, M.N., Mathias, D.K., Odiere, M.R., Mutuku, F.M., Kamau, L., Gimnig, J.E., Vulule, J.M., Hawley, W.A., Hamel, M.J. & Walker, E.D. (2010). *Anopheles gambiae*: historical population decline associated with regional distribution of insecticide-treated bed nets in western

- Nyanza Province, Kenya. *Malaria Journal* **9**: 62.
- Beier, J.C., Perkins, P.V., Wirtz, R.A., Koros, J., Diggs, D., Gargan, T.P. & Koech, D.K. (1988). Blood meal identification by direct enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA), tested on *Anopheles* (Diptera: Culicidae) in Kenya. *Journal of Medical Entomology* **25**(1): 9-16.
- Daygena, T.Y., Masseur, F. & Lindtjørn, B. (2017). Variation in species composition and infection rates of *Anopheles* mosquitoes at different altitudinal transects, and the risk of malaria in the highland of Dirashe Woreda, south Ethiopia. *Parasites and Vectors* **10**(1): 343.
- Favia, G., Della Torre, A., Bagayoko, M., Lanfrancotti, A., Sagnon, N.F., Touré, Y.T. & Coluzzi, M. (1997). Molecular identification of sympatric chromosomal forms of *Anopheles gambiae* and further evidence of their reproductive isolation. *Insect Molecular Biology* **6**(4): 377-383.
- Gatton, M.L., Chitnis, N., Churcher, T., Donnelly, M.J., Ghani, A.C., Godfray, H.C.J., Gould, F., Hastings, I., Marshall, J., Ranson, H., Rowland, M., Shaman, J. & Lindsay, S.W. (2013). The importance of mosquito behavioural adaptations to malaria control in Africa. *Evolution* **67**: 1218-1230.
- Giardina, F., Kasasa, S., Sié, A., Utzinger, J., Tanner, M. & Vounatsou, P. (2014). Effects of vector-control interventions on changes in risk of malaria parasitaemia in sub-Saharan Africa: a spatial and temporal analysis. *The Lancet Global Health* **2**(10): e601-e615.
- Gillies, M.T. & Coetzee, M. (1987). A supplement to the Anophelinae of Africa South of the Sahara. *Publication of South African Institute of Medical Research* **55**: 1-143.
- Gimonneau, G., Pombi, M., Choisy, M., Morand, S., Dabiré, R.K. & Simard, F. (2012). Larval habitat segregation between the molecular forms of the mosquito *Anopheles gambiae* in a rice field area of Burkina Faso, West Africa. *Medical and Veterinary Entomology* **26**(1): 9-17.
- Gimonneau, G., Brossette, L., Mamaïa, W., Dabiré, R.K. & Simard, F. (2014). Larval competition between *An. coluzzii* and *An. gambiae* in insectary and semi-field conditions in Burkina Faso. *Acta Tropica* **130**: 155-161.
- Githeko, A.K., Service, M.W., Mbogo, C.M., Atiel, F.K. & Juma, F.O. (1994). Origin of blood meals in indoor and outdoor resting malaria vectors in Western Kenya. *Acta Tropica* **58**: 307-316.
- Kenea, O., Balkew, M. & Gebre-Michael, T. (2011). Environmental factors associated with larval habitats of anopheline mosquitoes (Diptera: Culicidae) in irrigated and major drainage areas in the middle course of the Rift Valley, central Ethiopia. *Journal of Vector Borne Disease* **48**: 85-92.
- Kigadye, E., Nkwengulila, G., Magesa, S.M. & Abdulla, S. (2011). Spatial variability in the density, distribution and vectorial capacity of Anopheline species in a high transmission district in Tanzania. *Tanzania Journal of Health Research* **13**(4):
- Killeen, G.F. (2014). Characterizing, controlling and eliminating residual malaria transmission. *Malaria Journal* **13**: 330.
- Kitau, J., Oxborough, R.M., Tungu, P.K., Matowo, J., Malima, R.C., Magesa, S.M., Bruce, J., Moshia, F.W. & Rowland, M.W. (2012). Species shifts in the *Anopheles gambiae* complex: do LLINs successfully control *Anopheles arabiensis*? *PLoS One* **7**: e31481.
- Lamidi, B.T., Pukuma, M.S., Qadeer, M.A., Elijah, M.I., Ukwubile, C.A. & Dairu, F. (2017). Genetic variants, seasonal abundance and man-biting rate of *Anopheles gambiae* sensu lato in Bali, Taraba State, Nigeria. *Nigerian Journal of Parasitology* **38**(2): 227-232.
- Lefevre, T., Gouagna, L.C., Dabire, K.R., Elguero, E., Fontenille, D., Renaud, F., Constantini, C. & Thomas F. (2009). Beyond nature and nurture: phenotypic plasticity in blood-feeding behavior of *Anopheles gambiae* s.s. when humans are not readily accessible. *American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* **81**: 1023-1029.

- Mahande, A., Mosha, F., Mahande, J. & Kweka, E. (2007). Feeding and resting behaviour of malaria vector, *Anopheles arabiensis* with reference to zooprophylaxis. *Malaria Journal* **6**(1): 100.
- Mayagaya, V.S., Nkwengulila, G., Lyimo, I.N., Kihonda, J., Mtambala, H., Ngonyani, H. & Ferguson, H.M. (2015). The impact of livestock on the abundance, resting behaviour and sporozoite rate of malaria vectors in southern Tanzania. *Malaria Journal* **14**(1): 17.
- National Malaria Elimination Programme (NMEP), National Population Commission (NPopC), National Bureau of Statistics (NBS), and ICF International. (2016). Nigeria Malaria Indicator Survey 2015: Key Indicators. Abuja, Nigeria, and Rockville, Maryland, USA: NMEP, NPopC, and ICF International. <https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/MIS20/MIS20.pdf> Accessed March 12, 2020.
- Ndenga, B.A., Mulaya, N.L., Musaki, S.K., Shiroko, J.N., Dongus, S. & Fillinger, U. (2016). Malaria vectors and their blood-meal sources in an area of high bed net ownership in the western Kenya highlands. *Malaria Journal* **15**: 76.
- Nigerian Investment Promotion Commission (2020). Nigerian States: Adamawa State. <https://nipc.gov.ng/nigeria-states/adamawa-state/> Accessed February 15, 2020.
- Obembe, A., Popoola, K.O., Oduola, A.O. & Awolola, S.T. (2018). Mind the weather: a report on inter-annual variations in entomological data within a rural community under insecticide-treated wall lining installation in Kwara State, Nigeria. *Parasites and Vectors* **11**(1): 497.
- Obembe, A., Popoola, K.O., Oduola, A.O., Tola, M., Adeogun, A.O., Oyeniyi, T.A. & Awolola, S.T. (2019). Preliminary evaluation of village-scale insecticide-treated durable wall lining against *Anopheles gambiae* sl in Akorede, Kwara State, Nigeria. *Manila Journal of Science* **12**: 1-9.
- Oduola, A.O., Olojede, J.B., Oyewole, I.O., Otubanjo, O.A. & Awolola, T.S. (2013). Abundance and diversity of *Anopheles* species (Diptera: Culicidae) associated with malaria transmission in human dwellings in rural and urban communities in Oyo State, Southwestern Nigeria. *Parasitology Research* **112**(10): 3433-3439.
- Oduola, A.O., Otubanjo, J.H., Olojede, J.B., Oyewole, I.O. & Awolola, T.S. (2012). Malaria transmission risk indices of three *Anopheles* species in selected rural communities in Oyo State South-West Nigeria. *International Journal of Tropical Medicine* **7**(1): 42-48.
- Ogbeigbu, A.E. (2005). Biostatistics: a practical approach to research and data handling. Benin City: Mindex Publishing Company Limited; pp. 131.
- Ototo, E.N., Mbugi, J.P., Wanjala, C.L., Zhou, G., Githeko, A.K. & Yan, G. (2015). Surveillance of malaria vector population density and biting behaviour in western Kenya. *Malaria Journal* **14**(1): 244.
- Oyewole, I.O., Awolola, T.S., Ibidapo, C.A., Oduola, A.O., Okwa, O.O. & Obansa, J.A. (2007). Behaviour and population dynamics of the major Anopheline vectors in a malaria endemic area in southern Nigeria. *Journal of Vector Borne Diseases* **44**(1): 56-64.
- Oyewole, I.O., Ibidapo, C.A., Okwa, O.O., Oduola, A.O., Adeoye, G.O., Okoh, H.I. & Awolola, T.S. (2010). Species composition and role of *Anopheles* mosquitoes in malaria transmission along Badagry Axis of Lagos Lagoon, Lagos, Nigeria. *International Journal of Insect Science* **2**: IJIS-S4698.
- Reddy, M.R., Overgaard, H.J., Abaga, S., Reddy, V.P., Caccone, A., Kiszewski, A.E. & Slotman, M.A. (2011). Outdoor host seeking behaviour of *Anopheles gambiae* mosquitoes following initiation of malaria vector control on Bioko Island, Equatorial Guinea. *Malaria Journal* **10**: 184.

- Samdi, L.M. (2012). A study on the malaria vector (*Anopheles* spp.) in a Sudano-Sahelian Savannah area of Borno State Northeastern Nigeria and Insect growth regulator pyriproxyfen (S-31183). <https://irepos.unijos.edu.ng/jspui>. Accessed Feb 20, 2020.
- Scott, J.A., Brogdon, W.G. & Collins, F.H. (1993). Identification of single specimens of the *Anopheles gambiae* complex by the polymerase chain reaction. *The American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* **49**(4): 520-529.
- Shililu, J.I., Maier, W.A., Seitz, H.M. & Orago, A. S. (1998). Seasonal density, sporozoite rates and entomological inoculation rates of *Anopheles gambiae* and *Anopheles funestus* in a high altitude sugarcane growing zone in western Kenya. *Tropical Medicine and International Health* **3**(9): 706-710.
- Sogoba, N., Vounatsou, P., Bagayoko, M.M., Doumbia, S., Dolo, G., Gosoni, L. & Touré, Y.T. (2008). Spatial distribution of the chromosomal forms of *Anopheles gambiae* in Mali. *Malaria Journal* **7**(1): 205.
- Tchuinkam, T., Simard, F., Lélé-Defo, E., Téné-Fossog, B., Tateng-Ngouateu, A., Antonio-Nkondjio, C. & Awono-Ambéné, H.P. (2010). Bionomics of Anopheline species and malaria transmission dynamics along an altitudinal transect in Western Cameroon. *BMC Infectious Diseases* **10**(1): 119.
- Tirados, I., Costantini, C., Gibson, G. & Torr, S.J. (2006). Blood-feeding behaviour of the malarial mosquito *Anopheles arabiensis*: implications for vector control. *Medical and Veterinary Entomology* **20**: 425-437.
- Tukur, A.L. & Ardo, M.B. (1999). Livestock. In: Adamawa State in Maps, Adebayo, A. & Tukur, A. (editors). Yola: Paraclete Publisher; pp. 45-47.
- Walker, M., Winskill, P., Basáñez, M.G., Mwangangi, J.M., Mbogo, C., Beier, J.C. & Midega, J.T. (2013). Temporal and micro-spatial heterogeneity in the distribution of *Anopheles* vectors of malaria along the Kenyan coast. *Parasites and Vectors* **6**(1): 311.
- Wirtz, R.A., Zavala, F., Charoenvit, Y., Campbell, G.H., Burkot, T.R., Schneider, I. & Andre, R.G. (1987). Comparative testing of monoclonal antibodies against *Plasmodium falciparum* sporozoites for ELISA development. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* **65**(1): 39-45.
- World Health Organization. Malaria entomology and vector control. Guide for participants. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2013. https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/85890/9789241505819_eng.pdf
- World Health Organization. Malaria entomology and vector control: Learner's guide. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2003. http://whqlibdoc.who.int/hq/2003/WHO-CDS-CPE-SMT_2002.18-Rev.1_PartI.pdf.
- World Health Organization. World Malaria Report 2016. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2016. http://www.who.int/malaria/.../world_malaria_report_2016/wmr2016_full_report.pdf.
- World Health Organization. World Malaria Report 2019. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2019. http://www.who.int/malaria/.../world_malaria_report_2019/wmr2019_full_report.pdf.
- Yoriyo, K.P., Alo, E.B., Naphthali, R.S., Samdi, L.M., Oduola, A.O. & Awolola, T.S. (2014). *Anopheles* species abundance and vectorial competence in four local government areas of Gombe state Northeast Nigeria. *International Journal of Advanced Studies in Engineering and Scientific Inventions* **2**: 19-25.